UTQAP Cyclical Review: Final Assessment Report and Implementation Plan

1. Review Summary

Program(s) Reviewed:	- Child Study and Education (MA-CSE) - Counselling and Clinical Psychology (MA, PhD) ▸ Field in Clinical Psychology (MA, PhD) - Counselling Psychology (MEd, EdD) - Developmental Psychology and Education (MEd, MA, PhD) - School and Clinical Child Psychology (MA, PhD)
Division/Unit Reviewed or Division/Unit Offering Program(s):	Department of Applied Psychology and Human Development
Commissioning Officer:	Dean, Ontario Institute for Studies in Education
Reviewers (Name, Affiliation):	Prof. Bradford Brown, University of Wisconsin-Madison Prof. John Loughran, Monash University Prof. Sheila Woody, University of British Columbia
Date of Review Visit:	March 2-4, 2020
Date Reported to AP&P:	October 27, 2020

Current Review: Documentation and Consultation

Documentation Provided to Reviewers

Terms of reference; Self-study; Previous review report including the administrative response(s); OISE Academic Plan 2017-2022; Access to the accreditation decisions and reports for the Department's accredited programs; Access to all course descriptions; Access to the curricula vitae of faculty.

Consultation Process

Faculty, students, administrative staff and senior program administrators as well as members of relevant cognate units; representatives from community partner organizations and institutions including clinical settings and teaching hospitals and schools.

Current Review: Findings and Recommendations

1. Undergraduate Program (n/a)

2. Graduate Program

Unless otherwise noted, all bulleted comments apply to all programs reviewed.

The reviewers observed the following **strengths:**

- Overall quality
  - Impressive, thoughtful students in all programs at both campuses; UTSC students are "exceptional ambassadors for their developing program"
  - APHD provides high quality educational experiences, successfully integrating coursework, research, and applied training
- Objectives
  - Objectives of all programs are consistent with the University's mission and the OISE Academic Plan, providing applied professional instruction grounded in research on developmental psychology and mental health
  - Program objectives, requirements, and learning outcomes are clear, appropriate, and consistent with other similar programs
  - Three APHD programs are accredited by external bodies; each program's structure, curriculum, length and mode of delivery adheres to accreditation standards
    - Child Study and Education program is accredited by the Ontario College of Teachers, most recently receiving re-accreditation for seven years
    - Counselling and Clinical Psychology program and the UTSC Clinical Psychology field, as well as the School and Clinical Child Psychology program, are accredited by the Canadian Psychological Association
  - Counselling Psychology program points to membership in professional organizations as a way to ensure program quality
  - Developmental Psychology and Education curriculum is consistent with other research-intensive child development graduate programs in Canada
- Admissions requirements
  - Each program has clear and appropriate admission criteria
  - Curriculum and program delivery
  - Curriculum and structure of all programs is clearly communicated in materials available to prospective and current students
  - Clear commitment from programs to monitor community practicum placements and to build good relationships with placement sites
  - All course requirements can be met through graduate-level courses
  - Many programs offer excellent opportunities for students to gain research experience
  - Efficiencies enabled by course sharing across programs with similar accreditation requirements is "a clear advantage" of the department's structure

- ▸ Students have regular opportunities to co-author publications and presentations with their research supervisor
- Innovation
  - ▸ Unique and exceptional Jackman Institute of Child Study (JICS) Lab School is "a jewel in the crown at OISE," offering faculty and students an integrated setting for research and practice in teaching and learning; reviewers were also impressed that the Lab School is self-funded
  - ▸ Relationship with JICS Lab School for practicum placements greatly benefits the Child Study and Education program and supports the program's goals to build educational leaders; recent increases in student enrolment numbers have not significantly impacted the strengths of the program's practicum placements at the Lab School
  - ▸ "Innovative and important" distance practicum in the School and Clinical Child Psychology program provides supervised services to remote northern Ontario communities
  - ▸ Recent innovations in Indigenous Education include the "Natural Curiosity" educational resource and the planned practicum with an Indigenous Community
- Accessibility and diversity
  - ▸ APHD programs have undertaken numerous initiatives to enhance both accessibility and diversity; a significant minority of students in certain programs are "either immigrants, speak a non-English language at home, or come from a visible minority group"
  - ▸ APHD has greatly increased the proportion of international students and provides an array of supports for these students
  - ▸ Reviewers observed students' diverse range of backgrounds, perspectives, and experiences and noted that greater diversity in programs "seemed to correlate with awareness of or emphasis on issues of diversity, social justice, and indigenization"
- Assessment of learning
  - ▸ Developmental Psychology and Education programs offer the option to complete a six-week (full-time) internship in lieu of writing a comprehensive examination paper; reviewers were "satisfied that the program has high standards for the scholarly component of this experience"
- Student engagement, experience and program support services
  - ▸ Since the previous review, strong efforts to publicize programs have resulted in a large increase in the overall number of applications; most programs have a high ratio of applications-to-offers
- Quality indicators — graduate students
  - ▸ Strong time-to-completion rates in PhD programs
- Student funding
  - ▸ Students in the UTSC Clinical Psychology field show impressive success rates in competitions for Tri-Council master's scholarships and doctoral awards as well as the Vanier Scholarship; students in the School and Clinical Child Psychology program are also highly successful in attracting OGS and Tri-Council awards

The reviewers identified the following **areas of concern**:

- Admissions requirements
  - ▸ Counselling Psychology MEd program does not require a background in psychology or a related field for admission; reviewers noted that this is unusual for an applied mental health program
- Curriculum and program delivery
  - ▸ Finding high-quality practicum placements in community settings can sometimes be difficult
  - ▸ No clear plan for providing expanded research opportunities in the Child Study and Education program after closure of Research Intensive Training field
  - ▸ Clarity varies across programs regarding whether students will have the opportunity to conduct research with their own supervisor, or if they are responsible for finding other research opportunities on their own
  - ▸ Use of hybrid and online course delivery methods in some courses in the Counselling Psychology program's Global Mental Health field may limit socialization among students and the development of complex interpersonal skills required for counselling
  - ▸ Uneven cross-program coordination regarding instruction in certain subject areas
- Assessment of learning
  - ▸ Lack of clarity in some cases regarding how programs assess students' achievement of specified learning outcomes
- Student Engagement, Experience & Program Support Services
  - ▸ Issues of quality and availability of graduate student supervision; faculty graduate supervision workloads are much higher than at comparable institutions
- Quality indicators — graduate students
  - ▸ Student survey data show uneven levels of satisfaction in graduate teaching and academic advising
  - ▸ Inconsistent collection of data related to the success of each program's educational objectives
- Quality indicators — alumni
  - ▸ Comments from community agencies that psychology students "seem unaware of the requirements and process of registration as a psychologist once they finish their program"
- Student funding
  - ▸ Student funding is an area of inequality across APHD programs; unevenness of financial support across programs creates barriers to students from diverse financial backgrounds

The reviewers made the following **recommendations**:

- Curriculum and program delivery
  - ▸ Consider ways for Child Study and Education MA program to meet goals of providing expanded research opportunities for all students without adding to faculty workload
  - ▸ Increase cross-program coordination and course-sharing to reduce unevenness of instruction in certain subject areas

- Accessibility and diversity
  - ▸ Continue to support diversity of student population
- Quality indicators — graduate students
  - ▸ Enhance efforts to collect robust post-graduation employment data
- Student funding
  - ▸ Consider ways to address unevenness in student funding to ensure adequate financial support for all students
  - ▸ Harmonize financial support for PhD students with time-to-completion rates; be clear in communications regarding funding commitment and average/expected time-to-completion

3. Faculty/Research

The reviewers observed the following **strengths**:

- Overall quality
  - ▸ APHD is home to highly accomplished faculty with international reputations for the quality and societal relevance of their research
  - ▸ Faculty are productive and innovative in their research, actively engaged in program quality improvement, committed to their students, and enthusiastic to serve their community
  - ▸ Strong pedagogical underpinnings of faculty teaching and mentoring
- Research
  - ▸ APHD faculty have been remarkably successful in procuring external research grants and have maintained a high scholarly output; total research funding has remained consistent despite reduced faculty numbers in recent years
  - ▸ Faculty research "ensures that students have access to intellectually stimulating instruction, supervision, and interactions with faculty"
- Faculty
  - ▸ APHD faculty members serve on the editorial boards of prestigious scholarly journals and take on leadership and service responsibilities in major foundations and professional societies
  - ▸ Current faculty include three Canada Research Chairs and an Endowed Chair
  - ▸ Thoughtful faculty complement plan addresses the need for further expertise in areas of diversity, social justice and indigenization

The reviewers identified the following **areas of concern**:

- Research
  - ▸ Reviewers observed a trend in recent years toward lower participation in Tri-Council funding competitions
- Faculty

- Sustainability of faculty accomplishments is "threatened by the perfect storm of reduced faculty complement in the context of increasing program size"; faculty complement was noted as an urgent problem in the 2012 department review and seems to have grown worse in the intervening years
- Student enrolment in most APHD programs has grown in recent years but faculty and staff complements have not kept pace and in some cases have been reduced
- Varying levels of awareness or understanding of department's complement renewal plan among faculty members; "the message from program leaders about the renewal plan has not been successfully communicated to faculty"
- Obligations to attend meetings and other functions can create significant workload for faculty members affiliated with multiple program areas
- Heavy burden of service responsibilities for faculty, due to attrition in tenure-stream faculty, accompanied by the hiring of part-time instructors; current approach to faculty hiring is functional in the short run but not sustainable
- Reviewers observed a shortage of faculty with expertise in Indigenous issues, and noted recruitment challenges of finding either scholars with a strong research background in this area or scholars from indigenous backgrounds themselves
- Reviewers observed varying levels of awareness or understanding of departmental supports available to new/junior faculty, including mentoring and support through the tenure track process

The reviewers made the following **recommendations**:

- Faculty
  - Consider more efficient ways of conducting program business to ensure parity of workload among faculty groups and to free up more of faculty members' time for supervision, teaching, research, and grant applications
  - Proceed with the faculty complement renewal plan, adding tenure-stream faculty as expeditiously as possible
  - Improve communication regarding the faculty renewal plan to ensure awareness and understanding of both the plan and its timelines for implementation
  - Renewal plan should prioritize hiring scholars from under-represented groups into faculty positions
  - Place high priority on adding a faculty member with expertise in Indigenous Pedagogy and Elementary Education; seek philanthropic support to expand current educational initiatives in this area
  - Clarify the rationales for permitted or expected enrolments for APHD programs in light of current issues of workload and faculty complement size
  - Develop a more active mentoring program for new/junior faculty so that they are able to take advantage of various institutional supports, of which they might otherwise be unaware

4. Administration

The reviewers observed the following **strengths**:

- Relationships
  - Relationships among members of APHD programs are "in many ways very strong, with collaboration and cooperation, sharing of resources, and a shared sense of identity and purpose"
  - APHD programs maintain strong, harmonious relationships with community organizations, enabling a wide breadth of applied teaching opportunities
  - APHD faculty and staff work actively to advise provincial leadership in higher education (e.g., providing consultation on early childhood learning policies)
  - Department staff members display a great deal of pride in their work and are strongly committed to maintaining the program's stature and meeting individual students' needs
- Long-range planning and overall assessment
  - Reviewers observe numerous examples of APHD programs working to identify weaknesses and taking steps to improve their performance, including student surveys, unit reviews, and faculty retreats
- International comparators
  - "OISE enjoys a well-earned reputation as one of the best educational training programs in Canada, North America, and the world"; APHD has contributed substantially to this reputation

The reviewers identified the following **areas of concern**:

- Relationships
  - Morale in some programs appeared to be dampened by the high workload and lack of clarity about plans for faculty renewal
- Organizational and financial structure
  - Concern over whether structural resources for programs have increased commensurate with the growth in enrolment numbers
  - Administration, faculty, leadership, policies, and resources of the UTSC Graduate Department of Psychological Clinical Science are largely independent of OISE and "its de facto operations are not consistent with the ways in which they are represented to students"
  - Cooperation and coordination between OISE Clinical and Counselling Psychology program and the Clinical Psychology field, housed in the UTSC Graduate Department of Psychological Clinical Science "is almost imperceptible"; original MOU between OISE and UTSC may no longer fully represent the nature of the relationship between the programs
  - Staff members commented on a sense of increasing workload and responsibilities, without additional staff or other resources to assist them
  - Current arrangements for staffing the Psychology Training Clinic do not meet the needs of the facility for coordination or programming

- Psychology Training Clinic Director is a core faculty member granted one half-course reduction in teaching obligation as compensation; most training clinics for accredited psychology programs in Canada have a dedicated director
- Cost-recovery model of APHD training clinic is unusual in Canada, and limits both the clinic's ability to work with underserved populations and the breadth of student learning experiences
- General issue of inadequate/outdated resources; reviewers noted uneven research and clinical facilities between OISE and UTSC programs, and observed that facilities, technology, and software in the Psychology Training Clinic need to be updated
- Long-range planning and overall assessment
  - Reviewers acknowledge that program enhancements and increases in faculty/staff complements may be difficult to accomplish without new revenue streams for the department, and note that new revenue generated by expanding international collaborations has been offset by increased workloads in instruction, supervision, and support

The reviewers made the following **recommendations**:

- Relationships
  - Provide resources for the UTSC Graduate Department of Psychological Clinical Science to develop nearby practicum sites and extend services on campus to nearby residents, to enhance the department's reputation for active engagement with the local community
- Organizational and financial structure
  - "Through the open and honest discussions with leadership and faculty at both OISE and UTSC it was apparent to the review team that now is an opportune time to revisit their MOU"; the revised MOU should harmonize policy and practice at OISE and UTSC and better reflect the relationship between programs at the two campuses
  - Reviewers convey a suggestion to create a central location for departmental staff members to make their interactions more efficient and recommend additional staff hires in the areas of grants administration and technical support for the JICS Lab School
  - Reviewers note the "urgent need" to hire an FTE staff psychologist as Director of the Psychology Training Clinic
  - Provide stable funding for the basic operating budget of the Psychology Training Clinic to enable expansion of operations and support for underserved populations
  - Locate funding to update space and resources of the Psychology Clinic
- Long-range planning and overall assessment
  - Consider creative options for revenue generation, such as providing coursework toward credentialing for certain professions

2. Administrative Response & Implementation Plan

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
OISE | ONTARIO INSTITUTE
FOR STUDIES IN EDUCATION

<div align="right">

Glen A. Jones, Ph.D.
Professor and Dean

</div>

Professor Susan McCahan
Vice-Provost, Academic Programs
Office of the Vice-President and Provost
University of Toronto

<div align="right">

September 18, 2020

</div>

Re: Administrative Response to the 2019-2020 External Review of the Department of Applied Psychology and Human Development and its programs

Dear Professor McCahan,

Thank you for your request for the administrative response to the external review of the Department of Applied Psychology and Human Development (APHD) and its programs, and for the summary of the review.

The external review took place during the 2019-2020 academic year, following a period of academic planning at OISE and the conclusion of Professor Earl Woodruff's first term as Chair of the department. Professor Woodruff has been reappointed as APHD Chair for another five-year term effective July 1, 2020 and is best positioned to lead the implementation of the review recommendations. In addition to the department's five programs with their multiple fields and degrees, the review also encompassed the field in Clinical Psychology (MA, PhD) housed within the Graduate Department of Clinical Psychological Science (GD-PCS) at the University of Toronto Scarborough (UTSC). Broadly consultative and inclusive – involving the participation of faculty, staff and students – the self-study process allowed members of the department to reflect on their achievements and challenges while considering the future. I would like to thank the leadership, faculty, staff, and students for embracing the review as an opportunity for reflection, and for demonstrating a collective commitment to the department's continued success. We are also appreciative of the contributions of external reviewers, professors Brown (University of Wisconsin-Madison), Loughran (Monash University), and Woody (University of British Columbia) for their visit and consultation with us in March 2020; their report represents a thoughtful review of the challenges and opportunities facing both the department of APHD and GD-PCS. What follows is our response to the points raised (in italics) in your letter dated June 20, 2020. The administrative response was developed in consultation with Chairs of APHD and GD-PCS, and reflects key elements of their respective unit responses. Matters concerning the Tri-campus framework for Clinical Psychology are addressed in collaboration with the UTSC Dean's Office and the Office of the Vice-Provost, Academic Programs.

> *Faculty*
> - *The reviewers recommended proceeding with the faculty complement plan, and urged that hiring scholars from under-represented groups into faculty positions should remain a high priority.*
> - *The reviewers note that APHD faculty members "have a much higher supervision load than at comparable institutions, raising questions about the quality and availability of graduate supervision." They observed significant intra-department service requirements for faculty members, and encouraged the department to "derive more efficient ways of conducting program business to free up more of faculty members' time for supervision, teaching, and research."*

ONTARIO INSTITUTE FOR STUDIES IN EDUCATION
Office of the Dean, 252 Bloor Street West, Toronto, Ontario M5S 1V6 Canada
Tel: +1 416 978-1114 • dean.oise@utoronto.ca • www.oise.utoronto.ca

1

- *The reviewers recommended improving communication with faculty regarding departmental plans and procedures, observing variability in faculty members' understanding (or awareness) of both the faculty complement plan and the institutional supports available for mentoring new/junior faculty.*

The Department of APHD is characterized by high-quality research, well-regarded graduate programs, exceptional professional education of early years and elementary teachers, and an excellent reputation for clinical training. Many of faculty in the department are renowned scholars who are committed to the advancement of applied knowledge in various areas including educational practice, policy, and research that informs our understanding of child development, special education and adaptive instruction, mental health, pedagogical practices, and theory. Despite challenges related to the declining faculty numbers and a slow rate of replacement, the department is optimistic and has invested tremendous energy and resources over the past three years to improve its programs, create new specializations and mount new programs. These initiatives have substantially increased the number of students and led the department to the next phase of faculty renewal planning that will sustain the excellence in research and scholarship, while supporting quality of its academic programs.

Implementation Plan

(a) *Immediate to Medium-Term Actions (OISE, APHD)*

Faculty Complement Plan and Diversity of Faculty. The previous review of APHD called for urgency in dealing with faculty renewal given the large number of faculty who were eligible to retire at the time. Since the 2011-2012 self-study, the department has had 13 faculty departures (12 for retirement, 1 for other reasons). On the other hand, the department has hired seven new faculty members plus a transfer from another department; however, this modest growth has not helped to offset the challenges related to declining faculty numbers. In collaboration with the Dean's Office, the department has developed a strategic and fiscally responsible faculty renewal plan that will be reviewed and updated annually. In addition to focusing on replacing retiring faculty and supporting the delivery of programs, the plan will prioritize increasing faculty diversity while continuing to support the department's commitment to innovation. As a step in this direction, Provostial approval was received to launch two new faculty searches in 2020-2021: one teaching-stream position in Developmental Psychology and Education; and the second tenure-stream position in Clinical and School Psychology: Anti-Black Racism in Mental Health and Education. These searches will focus on diversity and excellence and, if successful, will strengthen the department's faculty complement and contribute to increasing faculty diversity. Furthermore, OISE's Academic Plan 2017-2022 calls for increasing the diversity of faculty, staff and students in order to better reflect the communities we serve, which, along with our commitment to equity and social justice, continues to be a vital priority for all of our departments and units. With a view to realizing this commitment and ensuring that equity is evident throughout all institutional practices and at every level of engagement, [OISE's Guiding Principles on Equity and Diversity](#) inform all decisions and initiatives, including recruitment, hiring, retention, evaluation and promotion of faculty. At the institutional level, the Dean's office works collaboratively with the Dean's Advisory Council on Indigenous Education (DACIE), the Indigenous Education Network (IEN), and the Black Faculty Caucus to increase participation of under-represented groups. A call for nominations for two Tier 2 CRC reserved for faculty from the four under-represented groups identified by Tri-Council will soon be launched and will be open to faculty from all four departments. These initiatives are intended to establish and support a critical mass of diverse scholars and graduate students at OISE.

Workload Management. The increasing faculty workload is an ongoing challenge for APHD and is a result of enrolment growth, rise in research grant funding, and expanded student services support. Over time, it has been exacerbated by the loss of faculty, inadequate staffing and increasing demands associated with department administration, supervision and teaching. The department does not have support staff to assist in

research grant administration (e.g. creating budgets, ordering equipment, facilitating contracts) further increasing the burden on faculty. To address this issue, the department will consider the possibility of adding a term position to support research, to be paid for by research funding across the department. Additionally, to alleviate pressures on faculty associated with intra-department service needs, the department will review its committee structure, which includes APHD Council, Executive and Program Committees with a focus on creating a more effective structure. An OISE-wide initiative, Thesis in Motion, has been set up to provide workshops to students who may be struggling during their thesis writing phase, which is intended to accelerate the time to completion for students in their final years and reduce supervision workload. OISE has also engaged in streamlining recruitment and admissions processes in collaboration with SGS through the use of the Slate platform. It is expected that these initiatives will increase efficiency in managing programs while allowing faculty more time for supervision, teaching and research.

Communications, Procedures & Mentoring Junior Faculty. Working collaboratively with colleagues across OISE, the department will continue its efforts to improve communication and engage in streamlining procedures. Since the 2011-2012 review and subsequent departmental restructuring at OISE, the department has added a dedicated Communications and Event Planner staff position to help disseminate research results, improve communication with students and support marketing, outreach and recruitment initiatives. As a result of the increasingly complex and growing operations, the department also added the position of Manager, Departmental Academic Operations and Administration, which has had a positive impact on managing the department's academic and administrative priorities. In addition to the department-based support, OISE Dean's Office organizes a series of Early Career Faculty Development meetings (4 to 6 sessions a year) facilitated by a senior colleague with experience in faculty development and mentoring. Recent sessions have included, for example, discussions of approaches to graduate supervision, teaching in relation to interim review, tenure review, and continuing status review, use of teaching evaluation guidelines, and preparing a teaching portfolio. The Dean and Associate Deans also provide individualized mentoring to faculty related to the development of teaching and research.

(b) Immediate to Medium-Term Actions (UTSC, GD-PCS)

Faculty Complement Plan and Diversity of Faculty. As a relatively new graduate department, the GD-PCS's faculty complement of seven tenure-stream and two teaching-stream faculty is not sufficient to meet the supervisory and administrative needs of a growing and vibrant clinical training program, as well as provide the best training environment for the departments' diverse students and the diverse population of the Greater Toronto Area (GTA), including the Scarborough region. With the goal of hiring additional faculty to strengthen the current complement, the department's faculty renewal planning will be accomplished through a collegial and collaborative process and will be targeted to enable the hiring of faculty from under-represented populations including Indigenous, Black, and People of Colour, as well as individuals from other under-represented groups.

Students
- *The reviewers observed that APHD students were drawn from a wide array of backgrounds and experiences, which enhanced interactions with their peers, colleagues, faculty and staff. The reviewers noted that programs appeared to vary in their degree of student diversity and recommended continuing to support diversity of student population through selection procedures.*
- *The reviewers commented on the variety of graduate funding structures across programs, and recommended ensuring the availability of adequate financial support to remove barriers to students from diverse financial backgrounds.*

Student Diversity. APHD attracts excellent applicants to its programs, both domestic and international, allowing for admission of strong students who have a high rate of success in securing both external scholarships, as well as academic and other research positions. With most applicants coming from GTA

versus the rest of Canada and internationally, the need to continue to diversity the department's applicant pool is critical. Since the previous review, the department has significantly increased its international applicant pool and student enrolment. Specifically, the work on reinvigorating programs and creating new specializations (e.g. New field in Global Mental Health within the Counselling Psychology MEd), and increased international marketing initiatives (e.g. Developmental Psychology and Education MEd) have contributed to the growth of international student enrolment by over 400 percent over the last three years. It is expected that the new innovative EdD program in Child Study and Education, which will enroll it first cohort in September 2020, will contribute to this growth.

Student Funding. In addition to base funding, students in research-stream programs are encouraged and supported by faculty to apply for external scholarships. Rates of external scholarship among APHD students is among the highest at OISE. For example, since 2012, an average of 42 percent of students have been supported by external scholarships each year with most of these students being funded by the Ontario Graduate Scholarship (OGS) or a Tri-Council scholarship. Additional sources of funding include conference funding and working on faculty grants or winning small scholarships. Funding for students in professional programs (MEd, EdD and Flex-time PhD) include bursaries and loans, including OSAP, Graduate Assistantships (GA), Research Assistantships (RA) and external awards. The main funding mechanism is the GA program. In addition to students in research-stream programs, a provision in the collective agreement allows a determined number of students outside the funded cohort to access GA-ships. In the aftermath of the disruption caused by COVID 19, OISE increased its emergency bursaries budget, and participates in the SGS tuition fee exemption initiative for students who need an additional semester to complete their degree.

Implementation Plan

(a) Immediate to Medium-Term Actions (OISE, APHD)

Under the Equity, Diversity and Accessibility focusing theme, the OISE Academic Plan 2017-2022 includes an objective to "ensure appropriate admissions, recruitment and retention policies, based on clearly identified goals, in order to increase diversity among students." To respond to this objective, in collaboration with the Office of Associate Dean, Programs, the Office of the Registrar and Student Services (ORSS), and the Office of Communications and External Relations, the new [recruitment website](#) was launched and supports diverse student recruitment. Additionally, as per the Academic Plan, a staff position to support the departments with recruitment and retention of international students, including identifying sources of funding for international students was established within the ORSS. Similarly, the Indigenous Education Liaison staff position was created within the Office of the Dean to provide administration and coordination support for Indigenous activities including Indigenous student recruitment and retention. In 2017-2018, OISE's Diverse Recruitment and Admissions Working group (DRAW) released a report on outcomes of the OISE Applicant Survey, which was distributed to the departments and programs to help identify and address applications and admissions process issues that may inhibit diversity. Drawing on findings from this report, the Office of Associate Dean, Programs will convene a committee of faculty and staff involved in student recruitment and admissions activities at OISE to develop a comprehensive recruitment strategy designed to increase the pool and quality of applicants with a view to enhancing participation of students from underrepresented groups in all programs. Additionally, a subcommittee of the OISE Programs Strategic Advisory Group (OPSAC) will be established to review current and investigate new mechanisms for providing student financial support and identify means of increasing the share of student funding provided through external research grants and fellowships. Both the development of a recruitment strategy and improved student funding mechanisms are important priorities outlined in the OISE Academic Plan 2017-2022, and are expected to be completed within the next two years. The department of APHD will participate in these OISE-wide initiatives and will continue to review and refine its recruitment and admissions strategies, and engage in program innovation in order to further diversify its student population.

(b) Immediate to Medium-Term Actions (UTSC, GD-PCS)

The GD-PCS is in the process of reviewing their admissions procedures, and as a first step, due to the pandemic, has waived GRE scores for the current admissions cycle[1]. Over the medium-term, to ensure a fair and inclusive admissions process for all applicants and to diversify the applicant pool, the GD-PCS will review GRE scores and other admissions strategies such as website, promotional materials, and interview procedures to confirm they reflect the department's inclusion, diversity and equity values. Related to student funding, in 2020, GD-PCS undertook a review of their graduate funding structures resulting in an increase to the base funding packages for MA and PhD students from 20K last year to 21K for 2020-2021, as well as in additional stipends for students holding Tri-Council, OGS or CGS D scholarships. The department will continue to work on improving its student funding mechanisms and—since the length of the program can be a financial impediment to students from diverse backgrounds—will also develop strategies to reduce time-to-completion, for example, by encouraging more manageable dissertation topics and strategically choosing clinical training opportunities. These initiatives will help the department provide competitive funding packages and attract the best students to its degree programs.

Programs

- *The reviewers commented on uneven program satisfaction rates among recent APHD graduates, and recommended closer tracking of "the success of educational objectives in each program," as well as graduate employment outcomes, to guide quality enhancement efforts.*
- *The reviewers were surprised that the MEd in Counseling Psychology does not require a background in psychology or a related field, noting that this was unusual among applied mental health programs.*
- *The reviewers noted that the use of hybrid and online course delivery methods for international placements in the Global Mental Health field may limit students' opportunities to socialize and develop "the complex interpersonal skills required for counselling."*
- *The reviewers noted the closure of the Research-Intensive Training field within the MA in Child Study and Education and recommended attention to mechanisms for expanding research opportunities for all MA CSE students without adding to faculty workload.*
- *The reviewers note that the relatively new UTSC-based field has not yet had an opportunity to develop nearby practicum sites or extend services on campus to nearby residents. They suggest that providing resources for these services would extend the department's reputation for active engagement with the local community.*
- *The reviewers highlighted some areas that might benefit from better cross-program coordination and sharing, for example Indigenous content between specialty areas in psychology. They flagged the need for greater access to course work on diversity, equity, and social justice issues throughout the program areas.*

The department of APHD consists of five programs with multiple degrees and fields all of which share a commitment to excellence in academic and professional training in psychological, educational, and policy aspects of typical and atypical human development across the lifespan contextualized within a framework that acknowledges the diversity of human experiences. Over the past five years, the department has developed and implemented several program innovations including the redesigned Doctor of Education (EdD) in Counselling Psychology (2017) featuring the *'thesis – dissertation in practice'* as the culminating component of the program. In 2019, a new EdD in Child Study and Education was approved and will enroll its first cohort in September 2020. The proposal to add a new field in School Psychology within the Counselling Psychology (EdD) was developed and is expected to receive governance approval in the Fall of 2020.

---

[1] This is also the case for APHD for the 2020-2021 admissions cycle.

Implementation Plan

(a) Immediate to Medium-Term Actions (OISE, APHD)

Quality Enhancement. The department is committed to continuous improvement of its programs under the University of Toronto's Quality Assurance Process (UTQAP). Assessing the success of educational objectives, program and graduate outcomes is typically accomplished through several mechanisms including academic change (program modifications), student evaluation of teaching in courses, accreditation and cyclical reviews of programs, as well as through academic planning. Under the Transformative and Innovative Pedagogy focusing theme, OISE's Academic Plan 2017-2022 includes a priority to establish ongoing quality assessment for programs including collection of data on student experience such as exit surveys, focus groups, and the role of students and staff in academic change in order to ensure continuous program improvement. Following the approval of the Plan in 2017, the position of Institutional Research Analyst was established within the Office of Associate Dean, Programs to improve accuracy and access to data for departmental administrators, and to support data-informed decision-making regarding programs and student experience. With the conclusion of the 2019-2020 review, the department will engage in implementing the review recommendations and monitoring progress. Additionally, OISE is scheduled to undergo a Provostial review in 2020-2021 commissioned to coincide with the last year the current Dean's term. It is expected that within two years, following the appointment of a new Dean, OISE will engage in a new planning cycle and opportunities to gather and analyze data on program and student outcomes will inform future planning, academic change and quality improvement initiatives.

The Master of Education (MEd) in Counselling Psychology is a professional program. In addition to an appropriate bachelor's degree from a recognized university with standing equivalent to a mid-B or better, at least one year of relevant professional counselling-related experience is required for admission to the program. Over the next academic year, the program faculty will review admissions requirements for the MEd degree with a view to ensuring that these requirements are appropriate and in alignment with the Degree Level Expectations and the Program Learning Outcomes.

The field in Global Mental Health (GMH) within the Counselling Psychology (MEd) was established in 2017 and following its initial success in boosting international student enrolment, the proposal to establish a Dual Degree Program involving the GMH field and a Master of Science (M.Sc.) in Applied Psychology offered by the Department of Psychiatry, China Medical University, was developed and is awaiting governance approval in the fall of 2020. In their second year, GMH students complete a 250-hour placement in an international field setting while registered the APD1283H Peer and Video-Based Counselling with Practicum Field-Based Learning in Global Mental Health course. The combination of online and in-person learning in this course provides a supportive structure for students during their placement. The pandemic imposed shift to online course delivery has also necessitated rethinking of the placement for this course and the need to offer local in-person or remote placements. Nonetheless, the course-based learning experience, will continue to ensure that students have the competencies and skills needed to pursue work in counselling within the global context including treatment planning, case conceptualization, ethical decision-making, etc.

The Master of Arts in Child Study and Education (MA-CSE) is a professional program accredited by the Ontario College of Teachers (OCT). Since its inception in 1997, the program has successfully combined the requirements of professional teacher education within advanced study of education theory and research. While the program offers two fields: (1) Practice-Based Inquiry (PBI) in Psychology and Educational Practice; and (2) Research Intensive Training (RIT) in Psychology and Education, due to low enrolment, in the fall of 2019, admissions to the RIT field have been administratively suspended. During the 2020-2021 academic year, the program faculty will consider the future of this offering and determine whether to formally close the RIT field while ensuring that students in the PBI field not only meet but exceed the OCT accreditation requirements related to the use of educational research and data analysis.

(b) Immediate to Medium-Term Actions (UTSC, GD-PCS)

UTSC-based CP Field Partnerships. The GD-PCS, is relatively new and is in the process of developing community partnerships; however, since the review, the department has developed partnerships with the Ontario Shores Centre for Mental Health Sciences (OSCMHS) and Scarborough Health Network (SHN). In collaboration with undergraduate departments of Health and Society and Computer and Mathematical Sciences, the department received 600K in funding from the Office of the Vice-Principal, Research and Innovation (OVPRI) under the UTSC Clusters of Scholarly Prominence Program. This will help to establish an interdisciplinary Clinical Research and Evaluation Cluster (CREC) that will enhance parentships integrating epidemiology, health economics, clinical neuroscience, biostatistics, and health humanities to enhance the impact, reach, and implementation of evidence-based psychological treatments for mental health. It will also facilitate student training needs and clinical research. Additionally, the GD-PCS recently re-affirmed its participation in the Collaborative Specialization in Addiction Studies at the Dalla Lana School of Public Health, thereby supporting a multi-disciplinary training environment for students interested in studying addiction[2]. Over the long-term, GD-PCS will continue to leverage new opportunities to enhance its partnerships.

(a) Immediate to Medium-Term Actions (OISE, APHD)

Cross-program Collaboration and Sharing. All APHD programs include specific courses, or embed Indigenous, equity, diversity and accessibility issues withing courses. For example, the APD1290H Indigenous Healing in Counselling and Psychoeducation is accessible to all APHD students, as well as to OISE students as one of the courses listed under the Indigenous Education degree theme[3]. Additionally, the APD1207H Counselling Topics in Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity Diversity, and the APD5013HS Special Topics in APHD: Master's Level Dimensions of Diversity: Teaching English Language Learners, are courses open to all APHD students. While the department will continue to explore possibilities for cross-program coordination and sharing, the Office of Associate Dean, Programs will identify equity, diversity and accessibility courses that are open to all OISE students with a view to adding the Equity, Diversity and Accessibility degree theme to the existing four themes (i.e. Indigenous Education, Urban Education, Educational Technology, and Program Evaluation). Regarding courses on Indigeneity, currently, there are 22 such courses, most of which are open to students from all four OISE departments including APHD. Related to this, it is important to note the accredited programs offer limited possibility for choosing courses outside the program; however, most program have an elective space of at least two half-courses. Moreover, the Office of Associate Dean, Programs has undertaken consultations with DACIE members to explore the possibility of establishing an OISE-wide collaborative specialization in Indigenous Education, and to increase access and visibility of Indigenous courses in all programs, which will further enhance cross-program coordination and sharing while helping to realize specific priorities outlined the Academic Plan.

(b) Immediate to Medium-Term Actions (UTSC, GD-PCS)

Cross-program Collaboration and Sharing. The GD-PCS is in the process of reviewing its curriculum for "diversity" of perspectives, authors, and content starting with reviewing syllabi for Fall 2020 courses and this will continue in the Winter term until all courses have been reviewed. In the medium-term, the department will engage in a fulsome curriculum review looking to enhance their coverage of Indigenous, social justice and other non-western perspectives and worldviews with the goal of strengthening their curriculum in these areas. In this process, in light of OISE's leadership in areas of Indigeneity and social justice, the GD-PCS will discuss course sharing possibilities with their APHD colleagues. This work will naturally be facilitated with the renewal the MOU between UTSC/GD-PCS and OISE/APHD.

---

[2] APHD's CCP field MA, PhD degree programs are also participating in this Collaborative Specialization.
[3] OISE degree themes guide course selection and allow students to add an additional focus to their degree:
https://www.oise.utoronto.ca/oise/Programs/Degree_Themes.html

Structures
- *The reviewers made a number of recommendations regarding the operation of the OISE Psychology Clinic:*
  - *They identified as an "urgent need" the hiring of a full-time Clinic Director, to align with the practice at most comparable Canadian training clinics.*
  - *They noted that the clinic is "in need of attention in terms of generally updating the facility and a focus on appropriate recording equipment."*
  - *They observed that most comparable training clinics do not operate on a cost-recovery model, and note that "providing stable funding for the basic operating budget would allow the clinic to work with underserved populations… and enhance the breadth of student learning."*
- *The reviewers observed that "this is an opportune time to revisit the MOU between OISE and UTSC to harmonize policy and practice." They note that, currently, "presenting these two fields as one program does not appear to accurately represent their true relationship to prospective students." They recommended clarifying the structure of the University's tri-campus framework for Clinical Psychology.*

The OISE Psychology Clinic serves the professional training needs of the Clinical and Counselling Psychology, and the School and Clinical Child Psychology programs. It also supports clinical research and provides comprehensive and confidential assessment and intervention services to children and adolescents, and adults in the Toronto community. Faculty who are licensed psychologists provide direct supervision to students working in the Clinic.

We would like to note that, due the very demanding three-day review schedule involving meetings held on two different campuses, the reviewers did not have the opportunity for a comprehensive tour of the Clinic. For this reason, we would like to highlight that the Clinic has state-of-the-art facilities including equipment for video-recording of live psychotherapy sessions, a one-way mirror for in-vivo observation of sessions by faculty supervisors, and an extensive test library where students and faculty can access the latest assessment and instructional materials. Located on the 7th floor, the Clinic has two student and two faculty offices, a reception and waiting area with eleven clinical rooms, two group rooms, a clinical training room with play therapy with a small desk for young clients to work. There are also two AV rooms, photocopying room, and storage room. In 2017, the Clinic went through a renovation and doubled its footprint. The Clinic operations are managed by a full-time Administrator and a Steering Committee of faculty and students responsible for developing Clinic policy, monitoring the effectiveness of the management, and generating recommendations for action. The Clinic has an additional budget of $82,849 mostly to pay support staff salary and benefits.

(a) Immediate to Medium-term Actions (OISE, APHD)

The last five years have seen significant development of the size and role of the Psychology Clinic. Through the Toronto Area Internship Consortium partnership, the Clinic is a "community meeting place" for excellence in the provision of psychological services. As such, the Clinic is increasingly viewed by APHD as a place where some of the real challenges of those living in the city can be addressed through assessment, academic remediation and psychological counselling services. Over the next cycle, the department will explore how the Clinic could grow its role as a hub of expertise and opportunity for meeting some of the needs of Toronto's diverse, vulnerable, urban populations. For example, the Clinic could offer networking and professional education opportunities including offering courses for professionals needing additional training in assessment or intervention with specific client groups. Finally, through the Clinic, the department's expertise in academic intervention could be profiled by involving professional master's students (MEd & MA-CSE) partnering specifically with high-needs schools.

The Tri-Camus Framework for Clinical Psychology. The Counselling and Clinical Psychology (CCP) program is part of the framework for the current and future development of Clinical Psychology as a tri-campus offering at the University of Toronto. The framework was established by the Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) signed by OISE and UTSC Deans and Chairs of Psychology Departments on May 6, 2013[4]. According to this framework, OISE's program in Counselling Psychology was renamed 'Counselling and Clinical Psychology' with two fields: 'Clinical and Counselling Psychology (CCP)'—based at OISE and offered within the Department of APHD, and 'Clinical Psychology (CP)'—based at UTSC and offered within the GD-PCS. The rationale for the establishment of the tri-campus framework for Clinical Psychology, was in keeping with the principles and objectives of the University's Towards 2030 long-range planning document including: (1) the development of graduate programs on all three campuses; and (2) non-duplication of doctoral stream graduate programs across the three campuses. The framework necessitated the review of the UTSC-based CP field along with the review of the Department of APHD and its programs in 2019-2020. Although this arrangement added to the complexity of the review process from selecting reviewers, harmonizing input from each department within the self-study, and coordinating a more demanding review schedule that involved a visit to two University of Toronto campuses, the review also represented an opportunity for collaboration between the two divisions and their respective departments.

Implementation Plan

(b) Immediate to Medium-term Actions (OISE, APHD & UTSC, GD-PCS)

Because the review report raised issues related to the tri-campus Framework for Clinical Psychology, on July 27, 2020, the Office of the Vice-Provost, Academic Programs, arranged a meeting with OISE Dean, and Associate Dean, Programs to gain insights and discuss next steps for the tri-campus Clinical Psychology offerings. Following the consideration of the administrative response to the APHD review and other review documents (i.e. the review report, self-study and unit responses) by the Committee on Academic Policy & Programs (AP&P) on October 27, 2020, the Vice-Provost, Academic Programs Office will convene additional meetings involving academic and administrative leaders and faculty from OISE and UTSC to work towards the renewal of the MOU. It is expected that this process will clarify the structures ensuring that they are sustainable and represent the true relationship between the two divisions and their respective departments. Both OISE and UTSC and their departments of APHD and GD-PCS respectively agree that the 2020-2021 academic year is the opportune time to engage in the MOU renewal and look forward to working with the Office of the Vice-Provost, Academic Programs to facilitate this important process.

We trust that this response addresses the main areas raised by the reviewers. Please contact me if you have any questions or require additional information.

Sincerely,

Glen A. Jones, PhD
Professor and Dean, Ontario Institute for Studies in Education

Cc: Professor William Gough, Vice-Principal Academic and Dean, UTSC
        Professor Vina Goghari, Chair, Graduate Department of Psychological Clinical Science, UTSC
        Professor Earl Woodruff, Chair, Department of Applied Psychology and Human Development, OISE

---

[4] Although the MOU stipulates that it should be reviewed annually, it has not been reviewed since it was signed.

3. Committee on Academic Policy & Programs (AP&P) Findings

The spokesperson for the Reading Group reported that the summary covered the full Review. The groups noted that the external reviewers recognized APHD's highly accomplished faculty, its impressive graduate students, as well as its hard-working and dedicated administrative staff. The Group agreed that the Dean's administrative response fully addressed the issues identified.

Dean Glen Jones noted the strength of the review and noted the important collaboration between the department and UTSC's Psychological Clinical Science graduate unit.

No follow-up report was requested.

4. Institutional Executive Summary

The reviewers praised the Department's substantial contributions to OISE's reputation as one of the best educational training programs in the world; they were impressed by the high caliber of the students in all of the Department's programs across both campuses, and noted their success at obtaining awards and fellowships; they commended the faculty's record of research excellence; they noted the department's innovative facilities and practices, in particular the School and Clinical Child Psychology program's distance practicum and the Jackman Institute's Lab School; and they praised the department's numerous recent initiative to enhance accessibility, diversity and indigeneity across its administration and academic offerings. The reviewers recommended that the following issues be addressed: proceeding with the faculty complement plan and prioritizing scholars from under-represented groups; addressing significant intra-department service requirements for faculty and considering more efficient ways of conducting program business to free up faculty time for supervision, teaching and research; improving communication with faculty regarding departmental plans and procedures; continuing to support diversity of student population through selection procedures; ensuring the availability of adequate financial support to remove barriers to students from diverse financial backgrounds; considering background requirements in psychology or a related field for the MEd in Counselling Psychology; addressing potentially limited opportunities to socialize and develop interpersonal skills for international placements in the Global Mental Health field; considering mechanisms for expanding research opportunities for all MA CSE students without adding to faculty workload; tracking "the success of educational objectives in each program," and graduate employment outcomes; providing resources for the UTSC-based field to develop practicum sites or extend services on campus; improving cross-program coordination and sharing, in particular related to diversity, equity and social justice issues; clarifying the structure of the University's tri-campus framework for Clinical Psychology; and addressing operational issues at the OISE Psychology Clinic by hiring a full-time Clinic Director, updating the facility, and providing stable funding for the basic operating budget.

5. Monitoring and Date of Next Review

The Dean's Office will monitor the implementation of recommendations through ongoing meetings with the department leadership. A brief report to the Office of the Vice-Provost,

Academic Programs, midway between the March 2020 site visit and the year of the next site visit, will be prepared.

The next review of the department and its programs will be in the 2027-28 academic year.

6. Distribution

On June 30, 2021, the Final Assessment Report and Implementation Plan was posted to the Vice-Provost, Academic Programs website and the link provided by email to the Dean of OISE, the Secretaries of AP&P, Academic Board and Governing Council, and the Ontario Universities Council on Quality Assurance. The Dean provided the link to the Department Chairs.