

**University of Toronto Quality Assurance Process (UTQAP)
Cyclical Review: Final Assessment Report & Implementation Plan**

<p>Program(s):</p> <p>* Conjoint programs are at the “Second entry undergraduate/ Basic” level unless otherwise noted</p> <p>** “Graduate/Advanced level program”</p> <p>*** Closure approved March 14, 2012</p>	<p>Programs offered conjointly by the Toronto School of Theology and the University of Toronto:*</p> <p>Emmanuel College</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Master of Divinity • Master of Pastoral Studies • Master of Religious Education • Master of Sacred Music • Master of Theological Studies • Doctor of Ministry** • Master of Theology** • Doctor of Theology** <p>Knox College</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Master of Divinity • Master of Religious Education • Master of Theological Studies • Doctor of Ministry** • Master of Theology** • Doctor of Theology** <p>Regis College</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Master of Arts in Ministry and Spirituality • Master of Divinity • Master of Theological Studies • Doctor of Ministry** • Master of Theology** • Doctor of Theology** <p>St. Augustine’s Seminary</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Master of Divinity • Master of Religious Education • Master of Theological Studies <p>University of St. Michael’s College Faculty of Theology</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Master of Divinity • Master of Religious Education • Master of Theological Studies • Doctor of Ministry** • Master of Theology** • Doctor of Theology** <p>University of Trinity College, Faculty of Divinity</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Master of Divinity • Master of Theological Studies • Doctor of Ministry** • Master of Theology** • Doctor of Theology** <p>Wycliffe College</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Master of Divinity • Master of Religion*** • Master of Theological Studies • Doctor of Ministry** • Master of Theology** • Doctor of Theology**
<p>Division/Unit:</p>	<p>Toronto School of Theology</p>
<p>Commissioning Officer:</p>	<p>Provost, University of Toronto</p>

Reviewers (Name, Affiliation):	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Dr. Ellen Aitken, Professor and Dean, Faculty of Religious Studies, McGill University 2. Dr. David F. Ford, Regius Professor of Divinity, Faculty of Divinity, University of Cambridge 3. Dr. Richard Rosengarten, Associate Professor of Religion and Literature and former Dean, Divinity School, University of Chicago
Date of review visit:	January 10-11, 2012
Date reported to AP&P:	October 29, 2012

1. Outcome:

- The Committee on Academic Policy and Programs (AP&P) requested a follow up report in one year, including the content of the proposed conjoint PhD degree and concerning faculty appointments.

2. Significant program strengths:

- Small-group study
- Co-curricular activities
- Opportunities for personal growth outside the classroom

3. Opportunities for program improvement and enhancement. The reviewers recommended that the following be considered:

- Addressing the “below standard” quality of the Doctor of Ministry and Doctor of Theology, including closing the Doctor of Theology program
- Addressing the number of students who are admitted to the conjoint Doctor of Theology program but subsequently transfer to and graduate from the PhD program solely offered by the University of St. Michael’s College
- Developing a process to ensure that faculty involved in the offering of conjoint degrees meet U of T standards for research, teaching and other qualifications
- Creating a conjoint PhD (and also possibly a conjoint MA) program
- Coordinating and streamlining course and program offerings across TST member colleges, including differentiating between and articulating common educational standards and purposes for basic (i.e. second entry undergraduate) and advanced (i.e. graduate) degrees
- Developing a faculty renewal plan across TST member colleges to support coordinated, streamlined program offerings
- Improving the research profile of the faculty to increase the number of grant applications and number of externally funded research grants
- Developing a TST long-range plan
- Developing TST and U of T’s relationship in alignment with *Towards 2030*, including exploring models for a closer relationship that could serve a range of academic, professional and external communities

4. Implementation Plan

The Director undertook in consultation with the School and Member Institutions to support the following changes:

- Immediate Term (6 months)
 - Addressing the “below standard” quality of the Doctor of Ministry
 - i. TST has appointed a new Interim Director of the program with a mandate to reform and reorganize it; the Interim Director has made personnel changes, reorganized the office, and cleared backlog of delays in student supervision and assessment; working with academic governance, the Interim Director has reorganized and revised courses to clarify graduate degree level expectations, and significantly revised, focused and simplified the curriculum to connect it to program goals; highly qualified core faculty members have been identified; program supervisions are actively and creatively managed; program deadlines and grading policies are being carefully enforced; teaching of research methods has been improved
 - Addressing the “below standard” quality of the Doctor of Theology
 - i. TST has struck a Task Force (with membership from cognate units at U of T and support from the U of T Provost’s Office and School of Graduate Studies) to develop a conjoint PhD program which will replace ThD program (the ThD will be closed); the process includes a review of faculty research, redefinition of fields, review of admissions process, improvements in curriculum and mentoring arrangements, intentional cohort formation, efficient deployment of faculty resources, and full conformity with SGS policies
 - ii. TST has undertaken a review of faculty CVs, using a three-person panel consisting of faculty from TST, U of T and an external U.S. institution, to identify core faculty for the proposed conjoint PhD

- Coordinating and streamlining course and program offerings
 - i. TST recognizes the need to reduce the number programs and introduce clear streams; TST has closed one of the seven conjoint programs
- Addressing the number of students who are admitted to the conjoint ThD but transfer to and graduate from the non-conjoint PhD
 - i. TST has advised students admitted since May 1, 2012 that transfers will not be available; students already in progress will be allowed to transfer according to prevailing practice at the time of their admission
- Developing a process to ensure that faculty involved in conjoint degrees meet U of T standards
 - i. The Memorandum of Agreement ensures that faculty involved in offering conjoint degrees meet U of T standards for research, teaching and other qualifications; all faculty members with graduate program functions are approved by a committee which has two U of T representatives; formerly allowed *ad hoc* appointments for graduate degree teaching and supervision have been discontinued; some TST member colleges already include U of T members on faculty search committees and other member colleges may develop similar practices
 - ii. TST will develop processes for graduate faculty review to ensure that under-performing faculty can be identified; TST member colleges will develop processes for second entry undergraduate faculty review to ensure that under-performing faculty can be identified
 - iii. TST is working to distinguish a teaching stream within the complement which would function at the basic degree level, particularly in the professional stream
- Medium Term (1-2 years)
 - Developing a faculty renewal plan; improving the research profile of the faculty; developing a TST long-range plan:
 - i. TST has launched a Towards 2030-type planning process, which will include a faculty renewal plan and strategies for improving the research profile of the faculty
 - Coordinating and streamlining course and program offerings
 - i. TST is taking a look at its programs and exploring the possibility of re-organizing some second entry undergraduate programs as fields within its graduate programs
 - ii. TST has begun to analyze its course offerings to address concerns regarding duplication, is contemplating clearer naming and descriptions of courses, and has begun a conversation about improving communication between member colleges to ensure that courses are launched in a coordinated fashion
 - Creating a conjoint PhD program
 - i. Participating member colleges will create a graduate centre to administer the proposed conjoint PhD program that will replace the ThD, allowing a much more efficient allocation of faculty resources and the promotion of a common research culture
 - Addressing the “below standard” programs
 - i. DMin: TST will submit a proposal to have the conjoint DMin recognized at the graduate level
 - ii. Non-conjoint PhD: TST intends to close the non-conjoint PhD program
- Longer Term (3-5 years)
 - Developing TST and U of T’s relationship
 - i. If the new Canadian Yeshiva and Rabbinical School becomes provincially chartered, TST would support its full membership in TST and facilitate applications for opening conjoint degree programs under the UTQAP

Under the terms of the MOA, the Provost’s Office will work with TST to monitor progress in implementing the above plan of action.

5. Executive Summary

The reviewers identified the programs’ strengths as the inclusion of small-group study, co-curricular activities and opportunities for personal growth outside the classroom. The reviewers recommended that the following issues be addressed: the streamlining of course and program offerings, degree differentiation, common educational standards and purposes, “below standard” programs, transfers between conjoint and non-conjoint programs, faculty standards, research profile, long-range planning and relationships, faculty renewal, and the development of a conjoint PhD program. TST has closed one of the seven conjoint programs and is reviewing others, and exploring the possibility of re-organizing some second entry undergraduate programs as fields within its graduate programs. TST is analyzing its course offerings to address concerns regarding duplication and is contemplating clearer course nomenclature and descriptions and better communication between member colleges. TST has appointed a new Interim Director of the DMin, one of the programs assessed as “below standard,” who has reformed and reorganized it to address quality concerns. To address the “below standard” assessment of the ThD, TST has struck a Task Force that is reviewing faculty research, fields, admissions, curriculum and mentoring arrangements, efficient deployment of faculty resources, and alignment with SGS policies. TST has undertaken a review of faculty CVs, using a three-person panel consisting of faculty from TST, U of T and an external U.S. institution, to identify core faculty for the proposed conjoint PhD, to be administered by a proposed new graduate centre, which will replace the ThD. Students admitted to the ThD since May 2012 have been advised that they cannot transfer to the non-conjoint PhD. TST has discontinued *ad hoc* graduate appointments, is developing processes to identify under-performing faculty, is drafting a policy to identify a teaching stream

of faculty for the second-entry undergraduate programs, and more TST member colleges will consider including U of T faculty on faculty searches. TST has embarked on the development of a conjoint PhD program, which will eventually replace the ThD. TST has launched a Towards 2030-type planning process that will include plans for faculty renewal and improving the research profile of the faculty. The Committee on Academic Policy and Programs (AP&P) requested a follow up report in one year, including the content of the proposed conjoint PhD degree and concerning faculty appointments.